

A WINTERREISE DISCOGRAPHY:

WOMEN SINGERS WHO PERFORMED AND/OR RECORDED SCHUBERT'S SONG CYCLE

"You have to be haunted by this cycle to be able to *sing* it."

Elena Gerhardt, said of *Winterreise*.

Having scoured the Internet on this topic I was appalled to read what I can only call misogynistic reviews, comments and references about women singing Schubert's *Winterreise*, and even some other of Schubert's songs. One English commentator who shall remain nameless said flat out that women singing *Winterreise* sounded like "caterwauling." Others implicated the female lack of masculine body strength along with the simple annoyance that women would dare to sing "men's" songs. That seems to be a later attitude, possibly the result of the women's suffrage movement and women finally getting the vote. From the end of the 19th century to about mid-20th century it appears that women singing a complete *Winterreise*, or some of the songs, in live performance got a fair hearing along with their male counterparts.¹

Johanna Schwartz, a pupil of baritone Julius Stockhausen, sang parts of *Winterreise* in an 1873 Stockhausen recital in which he had his students participate. Stockhausen, who gave the first public performance of Schumann's song cycle, continued to sing *Frauenliebe und -leben* in public indicating that he believed that the male-female dichotomy about songs wasn't tenable. Of course, a voice teacher would be happy to have his students of both sexes do well in recital without the expectation that they would turn into professionals. Even so, modernity worked against the continuance of the practice of women singing *Winterreise*.

In 1876, with a significant part of Vienna's Ringstrasse well along toward completion (it went on building into the 1890s), a retired opera singer, tenor Gustav Walter, began a series of *Liederabende* in Vienna's Bösendorfer Hall with other opera stars now tentatively accustoming themselves to singing art songs. Many of these opera singers were among the first to record *Lieder* which accounts for the predominance of opera singers in the early days of art song recording. And many of these singers also went on to teach, and their students became the opera and *Lieder* singers of the 20th century. Starting slowly, the *Liederabend* became so popular that Vienna had a kind of *Liederabend* craze that spread beyond Vienna into the rest of Austria and into Germany. Here was the great opportunity for Schubert-only song evenings that in a way recaptured the *Hausmusik* and Schubertiaden of the early 19th century, now in its newer disguise often helped along by several noted music publishers.²

To quote Lawrence Kramer: "the more professionalized the performance of art song became, the more the rule of gender asymmetry prevailed. By the turn of the twentieth century it had become rigid."³ In Julius Stockhausen's era and later (mid-19th century to mid-20th century) women learning to sing *Winterreise* (or any art song or operatic aria) were much like girls and young

1 But not always: "Although the original pitches of Schubert's '*Winterreise*' need not be compromised thereby, the cycle is rendered dramatically nonsensical when sung by a woman, even as skilled an interpreter as the veteran Christa Ludwig. Her singing is laboured and uncharacteristically inexpressive throughout, with no assistance whatsoever from the hard-driven, insensitive accompaniment of pianist James Levine (Deutsche Grammophon 423 366, CD)." Excerpt from "Artists and the State of the Art Song," by Herbert Glass, *The Los Angeles Times*, 24 July 1988. This critic seems not to mind women singing art songs in general – he praises others in this review – but *Winterreise* seems to be off-limits for him.

2 Laura Tunbridge, *The Song Cycle*, (Cambridge University Press, 2010), pp. 46-47. Tunbridge credits Vienna's Ringstrasse and, in general, Vienna's new architecture as invigorating the breakup of social barriers which closed much of "high" art, like *Lieder* singing, to the local bourgeoisie.

3 Lawrence Kramer, "Sexing Song: Brigitte Fassbaender's *Winterreise*," *Word and Music Studies* (Amsterdam), 12 (2011), 151-171; p. 151.

women of that same era learning to play prettily on the piano. These were amateur accomplishments that did not deny their femininity. To the contrary, these artistic talents on the piano served to enhance their chances in the marriage market.⁴

The entries below reflect late 19th century to early 21st century sound recordings. If the recording is dated after 1962, per Lehl's chronology (see note 9), chances are that long-play records (33 1/3 RPMs) and, since 1982, modern-era compact discs (CDs) appear. No doubt, many of the older flat records have been remastered for CD production. CDs are being replaced by newer sound technologies (MP3s and 4s) among a segment of the listening public, but there has been an unexpected revival of vinyl gramophone records that are becoming increasingly popular among musical publics, from jazz to opera.

As noted in the excellent compilation from the Hochschule für Musik Franz Liszt Weimar, there are numerous *Winterreise* performances that go beyond one singer and one accompanist. The so-called Bearbeitungen or collaborative performances with one or more singers and musical groups in a variety of combinations as well as a listing of *Winterreise* DVDs are in the compilation but these collaborations aren't featured in this article. The single most striking drawback of the HfM Franz Liszt compilation is the lack of identification of the singer's fach or vocal range. I hope this will be corrected in future.

Below is a grouping of late 19th to mid-20th century women who not only sang *Winterreise* in recital but also recorded some or all of the cycle's songs. The cycle's recorded song or songs are identified by the Deutsch number and the year recorded. The lyrics are sung in German unless another language is shown. Lehl ends his survey in 1962.

(Piroska) Rosette ANDAY, sang both mezzo-soprano and contralto. She recorded four Schubert songs in the anniversary year, with only one from *Winterreise*, Die Post D911/13, Franz Rupp, piano (1928)

Marta ANGELICI, soprano, Eugène Wagner, piano D911/6 (ca. 1942)

Nelly ASKA, soprano, no accompanist shown, D911/20 (no year) In French.

Ilse BERNATZ, contralto, no accompanist shown. D911/5 (1926)

Emmy BETTENDORF, soprano, piano trio, D911/5 (1927)

Maria BONILLA, soprano, Maria Kotkowska, piano, D911 (1951)

Germaine CORNEY, soprano, no accompanist shown. D911/11 (no year) In French.

Julia CULP, mezzo-soprano, Conraad Valentijn Bos, piano. D911/5 (1917) Not released.

Julia CULP, mezzo-soprano, Fritz Lindemann, piano. D911/5 (1923) Not released.

Julia CULP, mezzo-soprano, Fritz Lindemann, piano. D911/5 (1926)

Alice DERLANGER, soprano, no accompanist shown, D911/5 (1931) In French.

Maria EKEBLAD, soprano, no accompanist shown, D911/11 (1910)

Elisabeth van ENDERT, soprano, J. Brath, piano, tenor Ludwig Dornay, probably in duet, also listed on the recording of D911/5 (1915).

Elisabeth van ENDERT, soprano, J. Brath, piano, D911/5 (1922)

Elisabeth van ENDERT, soprano, Ada Herbst, piano, D911/5 (1927)

Elisabeth van ENDERT, soprano, Orchestra, D911/5, duet with unknown partner (1927)

Else FINK, soprano, Suzanne Gyr, piano, D911/16 (ca. 1945)

Lore FISCHER, contralto, Hermann Reutter, piano, D911/5 (1941)

4 Arthur Loesser, *Men, Women and Pianos: A Social History*, (New York: Dover, 1954, 1990). This same social attitude prevails in modern-day South Korea where sending one's daughter to a Western country for musical training is a much admired parental duty, if it can be afforded. This information came from a South Korean woman who decided to remain in the USA after her conservatory training to keep her position as an orchestral musician. She said it created great familial conflict that she wouldn't return home to allow her parents to find her a husband. She offered that this was a widespread middle-class social attitude in South Korea.

Kirsten FLAGSTAD, soprano, D911/13, recorded from Norwegian Radio (1954) [Added by author.]
 Else GENTNER-FISCHER, soprano, no accompanist shown, D911/11 (1925)
 Elena GERHARDT, mezzo-soprano, Conraad Valentijn Bos, piano D911/3,5,6,11,13,15,19, 20,24 (1927)
 Hertha (Helga) GLAZ, contralto, Franz Rupp, piano, D911/11 (1939)
 Maria IVOGÜN, soprano, Orchestra, D911/13 (1924)
 Marjorie LAWRENCE, soprano, Herbert Greenslade, piano, D911/5 (1946) Not released.
 Lotte LEHMANN, soprano, Paul Ulanowsky, piano (1940-1941, different labels noted) [Alan Blyth, *Song On Record*, Vol.1, *Lieder*, Cambridge University Press, 1986, p.46, notes that Lehmann's recording was pieced together from discs recorded between 1939 and 1943. There is no evidence given, although this may have been a practice of record companies.]
 Lotte LEHMANN, soprano, Paul Ulanowsky, piano, D911/5, 8, 13, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23 (1940)
 Lotte LEHMANN, soprano, Paul Ulanowsky, piano, D911/2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16,24 (1941)
 Frida LEIDER, soprano, Michael Raucheisen, piano, D911/11 (1942) Not released.
 Emmi LEISNER, contralto, live (1920s and 1930s)
 Jeanne MARIÉ DE L'ISLE, soprano, Orchestra, D911/24 (1906)
 Lucy Isabelle MARSH as Anna Howard, soprano, Francis J. Lapitini, harp, D911/5 (recorded twice in 1927)
 Inez MATTHEWS, mezzo-soprano, Lowell Farr, piano (ca. 1955) [Added by author.]
 Nadezdha Andresjwna OBUKHOVA, contralto, no accompanist shown, D911/5, no year.
 Augusta OLTRABELLI, soprano, no accompanist shown, (1939) In Italian.
 Sigrid ONÉGIN, contralto, Orchestra, D911/5 (1923)
 Elisabeth RETHBERG, soprano, Orchestra, D911/5 (1925)
 Marcella ROESLER, soprano, no accompanist shown, D911/11 (1926)
 Elisabeth SCHUMANN, soprano, Karl Alwin, piano, D911/13 (1927)
 Elisabeth SCHUMANN, soprano, Gerald Moore, piano, D911/11 (1937)
 Greta STÜCKGOLD, soprano, P. Meyer, piano, D911/20, no year.
 Eugenia I. ZARESKA, mezzo-soprano, John Wills, piano, D911/11 (1947/1948).⁵

More recent women singers - post-1962 which is Lehl's cutoff - who've recorded *Winterreise* include:

Miriam ABRAMOWITSCH, mezzo-soprano, George Barth, fortepiano (1994)
 Hideko ASAYA, mezzo-soprano, D911/1,11,12 recorded live in concert (uploaded to YouTube 2010)
 Julianne BAIRD, soprano, Andrew Willis, fortepiano (1996). Original 1827 version.
 Alice COOTE, mezzo-soprano, Julius Drake, piano (2012 – recorded live).
 Brigitte FASSBAENDER, mezzo-soprano, Aribert Reimann, piano (1988).
 Brigitte FASSBAENDER, mezzo-soprano, Wolfram Rieger, piano (1995).
 Birgit GREINER, contralto, Rotraud Söllinger-Letzbor, piano (1996)
 Katia HADJIKINOVA, soprano, Jean-Louis Bachelet, piano (2003)
 Barbara HENDRICKS, soprano, Love Derwinger, piano (2010)
 Ingeborg HISCHE; mezzo-soprano, Burkhard Bauche, piano (2014)
 Wiebke HOOGLIMMER, contralto, Patrick Walliser, piano (2002)

⁵ Karsten Lehl, "Zur Schubert-Diskographie: Nachweisbare Aufnahmen auf Shellack-Platten," in *Schubert durch die Brille*, 29 June 2002, 229-404. Lehl surveys shellac discs from 1897 to ca. 1962 and covers all Schubert *Lieder*, with *Winterreise* (D911) on pages 329-348. Lehl first lists recordings of the complete cycle D911, and then proceeds song by song to note those particular recordings. After 1982 recordings begin to be released on CDs. Lehl's compilation also appears online at CHARM (Centre for the History and Analysis of Recorded Music), and then proceeds song by song to note those particular recordings. After 1982 recordings begin to be released on CDs. Lehl's compilation also appears online at CHARM (Centre for the History and Analysis of Recorded Music), at: http://www.charm.rhul.ac.uk/discography/disco_special_36.html. Music)

Louisa HUNTER-BRADLEY, soprano, Brian Chapman, piano (2006)
 Anya LANG, mezzo-soprano, Bernhard Lang, piano (2006)
 Rosemarie LANG, mezzo-soprano, Wolfram Rieger, piano (1994? release date 1997)
 Julianna LAPINSCH, mezzo-soprano, Svetlana Potanina, piano (ca. 1995; also 2000)
 Ruth LIEBSCHER, soprano, Jürgen Plich, piano (2008)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, James Levine, piano (1983)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, James Levine, piano (1986)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, James Levine, piano (1988)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, Erik Werba, piano (1978)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, Erik Werba, piano (1980)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, Erik Werba, piano (1984)
 Christa LUDWIG, mezzo-soprano, Erik Werba, piano (1986)
 Barbara Kinga MAJEWSKA, listed only as “voice” for her extensive vocal range, Emilia Starz, fortepiano (2015?) Interpretational, not traditional.
 Lois MARSHALL, mezzo-soprano, Anton Kuerti, piano (1976)
 Gisèle MONSEGUR-VAILLANT, soprano and piano (1999)
 Margaret PRICE, soprano, Thomas Dewey, piano (1997 or 1998)
 Christine SCHÄFER, soprano, Eric Schneider, piano (2003)
 Anna SCHAFFNER, contralto, Magdalena Vonlanthen, piano (2008 or 2009)
 Mitsuko SHIRAI, mezzo-soprano, Hartmut Höll, piano (1989-1990)
 Joanna Halszka SOKOŁOWSKA, “vocalist” recorded playing *Winterreise* on the piano and singing the songs (2015). Interpretational, not traditional.
 Nathalie STUTZMANN, contralto, Inger Södergren, piano (2003)
 Maria TRABUCCO, contralto, Franco Trabucco, piano (2004)

There are women singers who sing selected songs from *Winterreise* in recital as well as the entire cycle but haven't recorded it. The date given is the first performance of the song cycle by this vocalist. In many instances, other performances followed in the same and succeeding years. Below are more recent women singers in live performance who haven't yet recorded the cycle.

Marian ANDERSON, contralto. She recorded *Schwanengesang* and *Die schöne Müllerin* and a few songs from *Winterreise*. No dates found.⁶

Kristina BACHRACH, soprano, CUNY Graduate Center, live (2013)

Julia BENTLEY, mezzo-soprano, Peter Miyamoto, piano, live (2016)

Anna FISCHER, contralto/mezzo-soprano, Theo Palm, piano, live (2011) Sometimes it is a multimedia performance.

Ariadne GREIF, soprano, staged version with tenors Theo Lebow and Chee Shen Tan and collaborative pianists of Mannes College of Music, live (2010)

Nicole Leupp HANIG, soprano, John Wustman, piano, live (2013)

Lisa HOUSTON, soprano, Catherine Framm, piano, live (2011, 2012)

Jessye NORMAN, soprano, in a staged version with Robert Wilson (2001)

Adrienne PIECZONKA, soprano, Wolfram Rieger, piano, live (2016, Schwarzenberg Schubertiade)

⁶ Anderson heard Elena Gerhardt sing *Winterreise* live in London in 1929 and wrote to the German singer hoping to work with her. Gerhardt issued two separate invitations to meet but Anderson was unable to fulfil those offers. Allan Keiler, *Marian Anderson, A Singer's Journey*, (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2002), 87-88; Anderson said Gerhardt's performance brought her to tears “confirming her belief that singing lieder was among the highest forms of vocal art.” Raymond Arsenault, *The Sound of Freedom: Marian Anderson, the Lincoln Memorial and the Concert That Awakened America*, (New York: Bloomsbury, 2009), 43. Anderson had all the Schubert song cycles in her repertoire. She recorded the songs from the cycles except *Winterreise*, and sang selected songs from *Winterreise* only in recital. One instance is from her 2 April 1937 program at Carnegie Hall where she sang *Frühlingstraum* (D911/11) and other Schubert Lieder. Anderson became especially popular for her performance of Schubert's *Ave Maria* – her favorite song, she said, which she recorded. Graham Johnson notes that Gerhardt's performance was sung to “universal acclaim” for the 1928 Schubert centenary, Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2014), vol. 3, 626.

Adrienne PIECZONKA, soprano, Rachel Andrist, piano, live (2017) Rosanne van SANDWIJK, mezzo-soprano, Michael Nündel, piano, live (2014, 2015)

Rosanne van SANDWIJK, mezzo-soprano, Moritz Caffier, piano, live (2015)

Lurette SAUL, soprano, Mark Rossnagel, piano, live (2016)

Jane STRUSS, mezzo-soprano, Brina Moll, piano (1999)

Sarah WALKER, mezzo-soprano: "I have sung *Winterreise* on many occasions in many places, from small halls in North America to the Wigmore Hall in London, and with the greatest pianists of my generation: Geoffrey Parsons, Graham Johnson, Roger Vignoles, Malcolm Martineau and, on this occasion, Imogen Cooper." Dates not found but Walker sang with Imogen Cooper in 1991. Walker never recorded *Winterreise* but has taught masterclasses on it.

Kathryn WHITNEY, mezzo-soprano, Anna Cal, piano, live (2015). The song cycle or part of it was performed frequently at The *Winterreise* Project, Victoria [British Columbia] Conservatory of Music. The project's Artistic Director Whitney performs the cycle in Müller's 1824 order.

COLLECTIF TORONTO (founded 2015) is a three-woman collective of singers who share the 24 songs of *Winterreise* in a staged interpretation of the complete cycle: Whitney O'HEARN, mezzo-soprano, Jennifer KRABBE, soprano, and Danika LORÈN, soprano, Tom King, piano, live).

PARTIAL COMPILATIONS OF SCHUBERT LIEDER

Schubert Lieder On Record 1898-2012: From its Notes and Editorial Reviews: "A unique collection of recordings of Schubert lieder from the catalogues of EMI and Virgin Classics and their predecessor companies, covering the entire history of sound recording in Europe from 1898, sung by the greatest singers of the time." The tally is ninety-one singers singing 213 songs on seventeen CDs. Released in 2012, and including many great women singers of Schubert Lieder, in this entire collection I found one woman singer with a song from *Winterreise* - *Der Lindenbaum* D911/5 by Julia Culp, mezzo-soprano and Fritz Lindemann, piano. This is included in the first listings above.

COMPLETE COMPILATIONS OF SCHUBERT LIEDER: HYPERION AND NAXOS

Happily, women singers are found in these two major and authoritative compilations, the Hyperion *Complete Schubert Song Edition* being the first to appear. Created by Hyperion's founder Ted Perry and pianist-Schubert scholar Graham Johnson, Hyperion began recording the project in 1987 and continued for thirteen years. Release of the complete edition of thirty-seven CDs was in 2005. Sadly there are names here who have left us.

Women singers in the Hyperion edition are: soprano Christine Brewer, mezzo-soprano Ann Murray, soprano Marie McLaughlin, mezzo-soprano Janet Baker, soprano Arleen Auger, soprano Brigitte Fassbaender, soprano Nancy Argenta, soprano Elizabeth Connell, mezzo-soprano Sarah Walker, mezzo-soprano Catherine Wyn-Rogers, soprano Margaret Price, soprano Elly Ameling, soprano Christine Schäfer, soprano Patricia Rozario, contralto Catherine Denley, soprano Felicity Lott, soprano Lorna Anderson, soprano Lucia Popp, soprano Lynn Dawson, soprano Edith Mathis, mezzo-soprano Marjana Lipovšek, soprano Geraldine McGreevy, soprano Juliane Banse, soprano Susan Gritton, and soprano Stella Doufexis – twenty-five women in all. The Hyperion anthology includes other composers of Lieder besides Schubert. Sopranos win with nineteen entries; mezzos are five and one contralto.

The Naxos *Schubert: The Complete Lieder Edition* preferred to use only native German-speaking singers. Among the women are soprano Ruth Ziesak, mezzo-soprano (also identified as a contralto) Regina Jakobi, soprano Maya Boog, soprano Christiane Iven, soprano Brigitte Geller, soprano Simone Nold, soprano Birgit Steinberger, soprano Caroline Melzer, soprano Julia Borchert, soprano Sibylla Rubens, mezzo-soprano Daniela Sindram, soprano Silke Schwarz, contralto Hildegard Wiedemann, and contralto Ingeborg Danz. Each of these fourteen women singers have a sizable

share of songs on these discs. There are ten sopranos, two mezzos, and two contraltos although one singer apparently doubles as a mezzo and a contralto but is only counted once.

In both the Hyperion and Naxos compilations none of the song cycles was sung by a woman. Tradition (male) - for what it's worth - was adhered to. I would urge any Schubertian to listen to any *Winterreise*, live or recorded, irrespective of the sex of the singer. Now that YouTube is chockablock with *Winterreise* videos, one can exercise that option with the obvious constraint of sound quality.

One final and personal note: In the last column, *WINTERREISE RECORDED COMPLETE OR IN PART BY WOMEN, 1901-2017*, I have a comment on the decade 1961-1970 for which no *Winterreise* recording was found. That may well be the drawback of online research but a good deal of cross-checking was done. The 1960s were the years of great agitation and protest among women in the USA in the fight for equal rights. This author marched twice in large protest demonstrations - 1969 and 1970 - down New York City's Fifth Avenue. We were screamed at, spat at, cursed at, threatened physically by men, and pushed around by police but we made headlines with our determination to end discrimination against women. I cannot say what happened elsewhere, if women demonstrated elsewhere around the world. "Oops, we did it again ... that is so typically us" (thank you, Britney Spears) in January 2017. I can only say, unhappily, that despite the around-the-world shared demonstrations and marches of this past January misogyny remains alive and well, especially as it is led by a male resident in a well-known historical house in Washington, DC.

A SPECIAL ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The inimitable Richard Morris of the Schubert Institute-UK has long researched and published discographies of *Winterreise* among others, his latest entry on the subject being "*Winterreise Discography: History and Analysis*," *The Schubertian*, April 2016, 20-27. He notes that his *Winterreise* discography was initially posted at the SIUK website in 1998 but is no longer there. I can say personally and authoritatively that trying to maintain and update a discography or filmography takes a hellish amount of time, while one has other research and writing commitments. However, without Richard Morris's immense knowledge and constant digging (a/k/a research) we who love *Winterreise* would be all the poorer.

SOURCES (in addition to those cited in footnotes)

- www.allmusic.com
- ForgottenOperaSingers at <http://forgottenoperasingers.blogspot.com/>
- Go Opera at <http://www.gopera.com/winterreise/recordings/>
- OCLC World Catalog (includes recorded music) at <http://catalog.bucknell.edu/title/winterreise/oclc/891447497/editionsreferer=di&editionsView=true>
- Presto Classical at www.prestoclassical.co.uk/

Schubert Songs at CHARM, http://www.charm.rhul.ac.uk/discography/disco_special_41.html

- www.discogs.com
- List of Commercial Recordings (Including Pirates): Franz Schubert *Winterreise* D911 (as of 04. 2016) at <http://opleid.info/list-of-commercial-recordings-incl-pirates1-04-2016-franz-schu.html?page=4>
- US Library of Congress

The US Library of Congress has immense holdings of *Winterreise*, recorded in all available media. The LC has 432 CDs and 149 LPs of *Winterreise* in its catalog. Other formats are cataloged as well – cassettes, e-music, audiobooks. In researching the LC I've excluded DVDs and older VHS formats. The LC cataloging, as it appears online, is duplicative (even 'triplicative' – some say this is

Here is LC's breakdown by language. It tells us something I surmise we already knew.

Language

- German (672)
- Undetermined (161)
- English (36)
- Dutch (5)
- French (3)
- Multiple languages (1)

* What could undetermined possibly mean in a great library institution full of scholarly language specialists? Their own entry details indicate languages like Korean and so on. I suppose that the saxophonists, guitarists and other instrumentalists play an undetermined language.

Janet Wasserman 1917